

M c L O U G H L I N



N E I G H B O R H O O D
A S S O C I A T I O N

HR15-02

Since the beginning of 2014, the McLoughlin Neighborhood Association has been participating in the development of the Carnegie Library expansion project. We have appreciated the commitment of the project team from SE/A led by Sid Scott, AIA and the Library Director Maureen Cole.

The Carnegie Library is located in the heart of our neighborhood and is surrounded by the following landmarks:

- Atkinson Memorial Congregational Church, 1924
- Francis Ermatinger House, c. 1845
- Stevens- Crawford House,
- 100F Hall, 1922
- Fire Station/City Hall, 1923
- Deute Store, 1905
- Christina Ely House, 1911
- WA & MW Long House, c. 1905-1910
- William Andresen House, c. 1900
- William B. Zumwalt Residence, 1896

All of these landmarks, including the Carnegie Library Building, 1912, make a strong statement about the diversity of architecture in the Conservation District.

1. The proposed addition has taken into account the relationship of the addition to the surrounding area and historic landmarks. It is compatible with the historic character of the McLoughlin Conservation District.
2. The primary building, the Carnegie Library, is located in Library Park. The proposed addition is designed to give the appearance of transparency through and visually highlight the Carnegie building. This transparency minimizes the impact from the surrounding rights-of-way and the other adjacent impacts.
3. Landscape- the visual impact of the proposed landscape is not appropriate for this historic site. The proposed line of street tree plantings along the Jefferson Street frontage. The landscape treatment along the Carnegie Park consists of small plantings and large trees in the park. This block historically never had any street trees along its street right-ways. They are not appropriate to the historic character of Library Park. The proposed “picket fence” of street tree is not appropriate in any location along the street right-of-ways. It is recommended that the street trees be relocated on a 3:1 ratio within the park to replace the trees that will be removed or have been removed.
4. The proposed height and bulk of the addition, while not smaller in scale, is appropriate in its overall design. The proposed design with substantial amounts of glass and use of brick allow the primary building, the Carnegie Library, to stand out. Specific findings will need to be made to satisfy this standard.
5. The proportion and scale of the addition, while somewhat larger, has visually articulated the horizontal, vertical and ornamentation elements of the Carnegie itself. The proposed new windows take their queue from the windows in the Carnegie (vertical orientation and width of muntins and lights).

The proposed design focuses on not detracting from the primary historic building, but creates elements to keep the Carnegie Library as the “view”- seeing through the addition to the main historic structure.

M c L O U G H L I N



N E I G H B O R H O O D
A S S O C I A T I O N

Other standards: Secretary of Interiors Standards

1. The square footage of the addition, while larger than the primary historic resource, has been designed to minimize its impact. The vertical and horizontal elements have been articulated to allow the primary resource to “shine” or be visually seen through the addition. The roofline has been designed to recede and not compete
2. The proposed materials will be similar in texture and color. Materials such as basalt and limestone should also be used.
3. The spray park, which dates from the 50’s, as well as the metal swing and slide are part of the ambience and significance of the neighborhood park. The neighborhood has been actively involved in the redesign of the playground equipment in the past. We expect that the same materials and configuration will be retained.
4. The research being done to find the correct configuration of the front steps to the entry of the Carnegie is appropriate.
5. The proposed addition is being designed to lightly touch the Carnegie with a hyphen- like element. This is good, because it allows the Carnegie to continue to stand on its own.