



FILE NO.: HR 15-02

HEARING DATE: Tuesday, February 24, 2015
6:00 p.m. - City Hall
625 Center Street
Oregon City, Oregon 97045

OWNER: City of Oregon City
C/o Maureen Cole Library Director
PO Box 3040
Oregon City, OR 97045

APPLICANT: Scott Edwards Architecture
C/O Joan Jasper
2525 East Burnside Street
Portland, OR 97214

LOCATION: 606 John Adams Street Oregon City, OR 97045

REQUEST: The applicant is requesting approval of an addition to the rear of the Carnegie Library, a locally designated structure in the McLoughlin Conservation District.

REVIEWER: Christina Robertson-Gardiner, AICP, Planner

CRITERIA: **The criteria for new construction are set forth in Section 17.40.060 as follows:**

1. For construction of new structures in a Historic or Conservation District, or on a Historic Site, the criteria to be used by the Historic Review Board in reaching its decision on the certificate of appropriateness shall include the following:
 - a. The purpose of the Historic or Conservation District as set forth in Section 17.40.010;
 - b. The provisions of the Oregon City Comprehensive Plan;
 - c. The economic effect of the proposed structure or the historic value of the district or historic site;
 - d. The effect of the proposed new structure on the historic value of the district or historic site;
 - e. The general compatibility of the exterior design, arrangement, proportion, scale, color, texture and materials proposed to be used in the construction of the new building or structure;
 - f. Economic, social, environmental and energy consequences;
 - g. Design guidelines adopted by the Historic Review Board.

BASIC FACTS:

The Oregon City Public Library is currently located and operating in the existing Carnegie Library completed in 1912. The Carnegie Library was placed on the National Register of Historic Places in 2014. In 2012 Oregon City Commissioners approved a 14,500 gsf addition to the existing library to accommodate Oregon City's need for a larger library facility. Oregon City voters approved the library bond in May of 2014 to design and construct the 14,500 gsf addition.

Site and Context

The proposed site is the Carnegie Park block (approximately 210' x 274') bound by John Adams St. to the west, 7th St. to the north, Jefferson St. to the east, and 6th St. to the south. The existing Carnegie sits in the middle of the block with its main entry and classical façade facing John Adams St. The site is relatively flat from John Adams St. to about half way to two thirds east toward Jefferson St. where grade slopes between 4 and 12 feet up south to north. The geotechnical survey indicates fractured and solid basalt 4-8 feet below existing grade that follows the site contours. Mature Dutch elms occupy one third to one half of the northern site with a few located along the east and west perimeter. All the Dutch elms have been documented with Dutch elm disease. The parks department is maintaining the trees to their best and longest life given the fact that they are diseased (see Arborist report attached). The south west area of the site contains an existing spray park and playground containing one steel slide and one steel swing structure. On street parking is available on 3 sides of the park with the exception of 7th St. and directly in front and opposite side of the Fire House. Sidewalks line the perimeter of the site with walkways at each corner that bring pedestrians into the park itself

Existing Building

The existing Carnegie Library is considered to be in the American Renaissance Style. It is a tall one story building with a low ceiling basement. The east side of the basement steps up 18" due to the sub surface basalt. The upper floor is 3700 gsf. The layout consists of 1 large room with high ceilings and a central fireplace, a smaller reference room and the original Librarians office. The lower level has net usable area of 1500 sf. (900 sf is occupied by a non-compliance ceiling height which is currently staff area and mechanical).

The exterior is clad in "Camus" red brick masonry with decorative brick pilasters that are clad in a cream colored brick with an articulated base and ornate entablature. The cream/linen painted wood windows are large yet high above finished floor to accommodate the perimeter shelving inside. The Carnegie sits up on average of 4' above the approach grade to emphasize the buildings stature and provide a civic presence typical to classical style design. A central entry portico and stairs define the existing entry. The proposed addition will preserve the classical front façade and existing entry. The new addition will house the main entry to the library which is located in the connector or "hyphen" between the old and new.

The New Building Design

Through an extensive design and public outreach process, Oregon City Commissioner's on November 12, 2014 approved a two story scheme that lightly connects the addition symmetrically to the east façade (back) of the "tall" one story existing Carnegie Library. The two story scheme was selected as it has the smallest footprint, thus taking up less park area. The addition is located behind the Carnegie,

preserving the entry view, allowing the addition to be subordinate to the historical building. Each floor is approximate 7,250 gsf with the upper level set back from the ground level (base) to reduce the overall mass and height of the second story.

The base of the new structure is clad in masonry and will follow the Carnegie in mass and proportion, but not ornate detail. This will both separate the two structures historically and not compete with the existing building. To reduce the contrast between the 1 and 2 story structures, the new masonry will continue to the height of the Carnegie parapet (20'+-) which will create a 1-1/2 story expression.

The second floor clerestory windows are capped with a cantilevered crown and up sloping soffit to again reduce the mass and height which allow the second level to float behind the Carnegie. The exterior material palette is simple to unify the composition. Similar to a slightly darker colored red brick is proposed for the new addition with similar size and coursing as the existing. Use of a cream/linen colored precast coping, aluminum glazing system with matching crown and soffit material is proposed. The parapet will be brick and precast coping or metal to match the window system depending on location. A light cream/linen kynar finish will complement the cream colored accents of the Carnegie allowing the upper level and roof line to float above the base. Other accents are a basalt or limestone cornerstone. Signage to be minimal and graphics simple.

Because the addition and entry are deliberately subordinate to the original structure the design incorporates a Library Plaza as the civic front door to the library expansion. Using the existing landscape and operational spray park as the focal point; new concrete pavers, a classical approach, new seat walls, covered entryway and new site trees will provide the foreground and gathering space to the new expanded Library. The new play equipment will be located in a new play area just to the east of the 6th St. entry walk. The equipment will be in the spirit of the existing but will meet current safety codes. (4) Accessible on street parking spaces as well as (3) 15 minute drop off parking spaces will be available along 6th St. Exterior site lighting will match existing which is an Acorn Style Park low height pole light.

Associated Land Use Files.

The proposal is also being currently reviewed under OCMC 17.62 Site Plan and Design Review for Development approval (SP 15-02). This HR review will solely look at how the proposal meets the standards set forth in OCMC 17.40 Historic Overlay District and adopted design guidelines. Comments relating to items not under review, such as parking, library hours, or permitted uses, should be addressed through the SP 15-02 comment process.

The Historic Review Board, however, does have authority to review changes to the public infrastructure that may affect the historic significance of a historic building or district and can place conditions that mitigate any affect. Further findings relating to sidewalks and planter strips, can be found in the staff report and proposed conditions.



PROPOSED SITE PLAN



2

FROM JEFFERSON ST AND 6TH

NTS





4

FROM JOHN ADAMS STREET AND 7TH

NTS



5

FROM JOHN ADAMS STREET AND 6TH

NTS



1 FROM JOHN ADAMS STREET AND 7 TH STREET
NTS



2 FROM JOHN ADAMS STREET AND 8 TH STREET
NTS



3 FROM 8 TH STREET AT MAIN ENTRY
NTS



4 FROM JEFFERSON STREET AND 7TH STREET
NTS



5 FROM NEW ATRIUM ENTRY LOOKING SOUTH AT ENTRY VESTIBULE & EXISTING CARNEGIE
NTS



6 FROM SECOND FLOOR LOOKING AT ATRIUM AND THE CARNEGIE
NTS

The following historic buildings are located near the proposed site.

619 6th Street - Francis Ermatinger House



Built in 1845, the Francis Ermatinger House is both an early and an unusual house for Oregon. The structure is a two-story rectangular box with a flat roof and a full length front porch. Four sturdy square posts with minimal bases and capitals support an entablature and the flat porch roof. The same entablature is repeated at the roof line. The exterior cladding is clapboard with medium width corner boards. The openings on the long façade are arranged slightly asymmetrically, with the upper and lower levels lined up. Most of the windows are wood frame 6/6 double-hung with narrow muntins and simple frames. The two windows to either side of the front door are 6/9 and have slightly more elaborate, classically inspired frames. The front entrance has a six-pane transom window over the door. The upper third of the door itself is also glazed.

710 6th Street - First Congregational Church of Oregon City



This church sits on the southeast corner of the intersection and features a prominent tower over the northern entry to the building. This tower features a pointed arch entry, recessed panels beneath a belt course that lies just beneath an octagonal bell tower that contains pointed arches with decorative tracery. A second belt course is present just above these openings, beneath the simple castellated parapet decorated with more recessed panels. The main body of the church is elliptical in shape, presenting a large bank of pointed arch stained glass windows to the street. Flat pilasters separate the windows, which also feature decorative hood moldings. These pilasters continue up through the parapet (also with recessed panels) and are topped by pyramidal spears. At the northwest corner of the building, a small rectangular bay with a gabled parapet provides a break in the repetitive nature of this section of the building. At the southwest corner of the church is a second entry. This entry is identical to the one on the north side, but the octagonal tower has been removed. Under the main body of the church, the English basement is lighted by a series of 1/1 double-hung sashes that are placed directly beneath the stained glass windows of the nave. The entire building is clad with stucco, and is individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

624 7th Street - Fire Station/Old City Hall



This fire station is a two-story rectangular, Mediterranean-style structure from 1923. The exterior surface is stucco with round tile accents at the tower entry. The flat roof is hidden behind a parapet wall with corner crenellations. The front door is reached by a series of 11 steps. The double doors are flanked by small windows and capped by transom and a small hood. The windows are 1/1 wood double-hung with transoms and appear to have been installed in the original openings as a mid-1990s upgrade. A vestibule entry has been added to its west side to provide handicap access to the elevated first floor. All exterior handrails, doors, and garages door appear to be a c.1995 addition.

602 Jefferson Street - William B. Zumwalt House



This Queen Anne of complex plan features a rounded porch wrapping around the front and one side of the house, with square spindle rail trimming the porch roof. The turned porch columns appear original but the simple rail is a replacement. Decorative balls top the newel posts, and lattice skirts the porch. Decorative stick work highlight the gable ends. The gables feature shingles. Six lights flank a central light in the front door. A rear room, abutting the carport, is sided with asbestos shingles and is an obvious addition given the small, sliding window. The windows are primarily 1/1 wood double-hung with blue aluminum sliding storm windows. Shallow hoods top the windows.



This two-story, hipped roof Craftsman c.1913 includes a rounded bay with curved glass, and a basalt porch with a cast cap. There is a cantilevered/jettied second floor façade with flared siding above a blank frieze. Large scroll cut brackets decorate the eaves of the hip. The siding flares at the foundation and there is a belt course. The porch roof joists are notched, and a semi-circular flat roof covers the porch, which features a beveled glass hardwood door with sidelights. Basalt terracing fronts the house to the sidewalk level. A cantilevered bay stands at the rear of the house, where a carport is attached and features

handicapped accessibility.

Noticing

Notice of the proposal was sent to property owners within three hundred feet of the subject property and the McLoughlin Neighborhood Association. Additionally, the property was posted with a Notice of Land Use sign with details about the proposal. Transmittals were sent to various City departments and other agencies regarding the proposed development plan. Relevant comments from City departments are addressed in this report as appropriate.

- a. The McLoughlin Neighborhood Association submitted comments for this application and generally concurred with the design approach by the applicant. However, they requested additional review of two landscape items (1 spray park and play equipment and 2. street trees) and the historic landscape of the park. Staff agrees that these two items will need further review by the Board at the February 24, 2015 meeting. Additional findings for these topics are found later in the staff report.

Oregon Revised Statute (ORS) 358.653

This ORS obligates state agencies and all “political subdivisions” of the state—including counties, cities, universities, school districts, and local taxing districts—to consult with the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) to avoid inadvertent impacts to historic properties for which they are responsible.

Impacts are usually the result of construction projects (additions, remodeling, etc.), but may also include the transfer of properties out of public ownership. The statute does not provide many specifics, and there are currently no clarifying administrative rules, so, as a practical matter, SHPO follows a “lite” version of a similar federal law, Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. In cases where federal funds, permits, or licenses are used, ORS 358.653 is superseded by Section 106.

This statute relates primarily to historic buildings and structures, but includes all real property that has historic significance. Protection of archaeological sites, on both public and private lands, is addressed by several other state and federal laws.

Finding: Staff submitted a clearance form in January 2015 and anticipates a response letter by the February 24, 2015 HRB meeting, which will be entered into the record.

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS: The applicant needs to meet OCMC 17.40.010 and the Adopted Design Guidelines for New Construction (2006), Addition and Alterations and Demolition.

Regarding Criterion (1) - The purpose of the historic conservation district as set forth in Section 17.40.010;

The McLoughlin Conservation District has been in residential and mixed use since its settlement in the mid 1800's. New construction, meeting the adopted standards, can provide value to the district. This criterion has been met.

Regarding Criterion (2) -The provisions of the city comprehensive plan;

Section 5

*Open Spaces, Scenic and Historic Areas,
and Natural Resources*

Section 5

*Open Spaces, Scenic and Historic Areas,
and Natural Resources*

Goal 5.3 Historic Resources

Policy 5.3.1

Encourage architectural design of new structures in local Historic Districts, and the central Downtown area to be compatible with the historic character of the surrounding area.

Policy 5.3.8

Preserve and accentuate historic resources as part of an urban environment that is being reshaped by new development projects

Finding: Staff finds that by following the adopted design guidelines for new construction, the proposed new construction, as conditioned, can be compatible and add long-term value to the district

Regarding Criterion (3) -The economic effect of the new proposed structure on the historic value of the district or historic site.

Finding: The development will add value to the District in multiple ways. It will fill a need for additional space for the library; it will also increase the vitality of the neighborhood.

Finally, quality new construction that is compatible with the historic nature of the district will add value to the district. Often historic property owners will choose to invest in the restoration and rehabilitation of their properties when quality new construction is allowed within the district.

Regarding Criterion (4) The effect of the proposed new structure on the historic value of the district or historic site;

The proposed height and massing of the building is sized as to not impact the library. The applicant has utilized a design approach that breaks down the volume of the addition and places it to the rear of the site.

Regarding Criterion (5) - Design Compatibility:

The proposed materials, and architectural features, as conditioned, are acceptable and meet this criterion if the Conditions of Approval are met. The addition is located behind the Carnegie, preserving the entry view, allowing the addition to be subordinate to the historical building. Each floor is approximate 7,250 gsf with the upper level set back from the ground level (base) to reduce the overall mass and height of the second story.

The base of the new structure is clad in masonry and will follow the Carnegie in mass and proportion, but not ornate detail. This will both separate the two structures historically and not compete with the existing building. To reduce the contrast between the 1 and 2 story structures, the new masonry will continue to the height of the Carnegie parapet (20'+-) which will create a 1-1/2 story expression.

Regarding Criteria (6) -Economic, social, environmental and energy consequences

As described in Criterion 3, new construction and additions meeting adopted design standards can add economic and social value to the district. Compatible infill in an existing compact neighborhood reduces the need for further expansion of the city, which adds considerable savings to the cost of infrastructure.

Design Guidelines for New Construction

A. LOCATION

- ☐ McLoughlin Historic Conservation District
- ☐ Canemah National Register Historic District
- ☐ Individually listed historic property outside of the districts
- ☐ What is the Immediate Context?
- ☐ The Block
- ☐ The Neighborhood
- ☐ What are the mix of existing appropriate historic styles?

Finding: This project proposed a (2) Story 14,500 gsf addition to the east of the existing Carnegie Library along with developing an entry plaza around the existing spray park and play area at the southeast corner. The site is located in the McLoughlin Historic Conservation District. It is a full city block bound by 7th St., John Adams St., 6th St. and Jefferson St. The McLoughlin Historic Conservation District represents a diverse mix of styles, construction types, and uses characteristic of a historic neighborhood that gradually infilled over a period of 100+ years. The oldest structures in the neighborhood date to 1845. Predominant styles include Bungalow, Queen Anne, and Vernacular. The 7th Street business corridor includes 19th-century 'false front' architecture and early-20thcentury

single-story commercial structures. Individually landmarked structures adjacent to the site include the Andresen House and the Ermatinger House.

Within immediate vicinity of the site (inside a 250-foot radius) are a variety of public facilities and amenities. Across 6th Street is the Atkinson Memorial Church and Education Wing. To the west along 6th St. is the Pioneer Community and Senior Center, the Stevens Crawford Museum (1908). Along 6th St. to the east at the corner of Jefferson St. is the Richard Bloom Tots Park. To the west directly across John Adams is the Ermatinger House Museum (1845) and Oregon City Fire Station. 7th St. has commercial and retail services. East on Jefferson is an existing parking lot newly acquired by the Library for staff, Dental office, Family Counseling Center and a residence at the corner of Jefferson and 6th St. Other nearby historic properties include the Judge Ryan House (1892) located southward on Jefferson Street, and the Zumwalt House (1896) and Andresen House (1913), as well as the McLoughlin House(1909).

B. STYLE

Determining the appropriate style is the important first step toward successfully designing a compatible building in the district. Decide which style direction to use from acceptable neighborhood styles and those in the applicable specific Historic District Design Guideline. The styles noted for the district have specific District modifications indicated

Finding: The proposed addition design is a nuanced contemporary style response to the existing American Renaissance / Georgian style of the Carnegie Library, the historic 2-story Commercial structures on 7th Street, and elements of the historic residential styles of the surrounding neighborhood. Consistent with the Department of the Interior's guidelines for new exterior additions to historic buildings, the proposed design may be distinguished from the original Carnegie Library as a product of its own time.

C. SITING AND BUILDING FORM

- C-1:** Review basic zoning requirements for New Construction for the particular site (R3.5, R6, MUC etc) to understand basic setbacks, lot coverage issues.
- C-2:** Review Siting, Building Form Principles and the Specific Historic District from Design Guideline. Note any requirements that are more specific than those found in the basic zoning.
- C-3:** Establish the Site Plan and the Overall Building Form. Is the use of the site and the building's placement on the site respectful of its context? Is the size, shape and bulk of the building consistent with the style chosen? Does it complement the neighborhood context? Is there too much 'program' for the site or style?

Finding: The addition to the Carnegie Library is an allowed use in the zone and setback s can be met through the Type II Site plan and Design process. The addition, in composition with the existing Carnegie Library maintains the existing scale and the beaux art (symmetrical) plan. The addition's masonry base echoes the existing building mass and the second floor mass steps back from the base so that it floats behind the Carnegie

D. DESIGN COMPOSITION

- D-1:** Design the building and site starting with primary design groups and major elements, such as wings, roofline, secondary portions, porches, window groupings, and dormers. Are these elements supportive or are they detractive to the historic district? Are they supportive of the style and building?
- D-2:** Review the design; Is it in good proportion and is the composition balanced?
- D-3:** Review the design and adjust to incorporate comments from the first review. Is the design representative of the style range and do the forms and individual features work toward a united design approach as viewed from the exterior?
- D-4:** Design the finer or more detailed portions of the building and site to fit within the framework established.

Finding: The proposed design is a flat roof which is consistent with the original Carnegie and the 7th St. Commercial building style. Proposed is a projecting cornice or brow at the height of the window head. The roof and parapet are stepped back to reduce the height of the building and provide screening for mechanical and solar panels. The windows on the lower level are large openings within the mass of the masonry base to echo the same window pattern as the Carnegie and emphasizing the strength and presence of the masonry. The second level windows facing John Adams, 6th St and 7th St. are designed to read as a clerestory or penthouse allowing for views back to the park and tree canopy. The light clerestory design of the second level reduces the perceived height as it relates to the Carnegie. The end bays of the masonry rectangle along Jefferson St. are full height with less fenestration responding both to the interior program, structural requirements and anchor the building to the ground in a similar fashion as the masonry columns of the Carnegie.

E. SPECIFIC DESIGN ELEMENTS

- E-1:** Design and choose specific design elements, products, and materials that are allowable and consistent with the design styling and framework established.
- E-2:** Does the design still fit the style's 'vocabulary'? Have extraneous or excessive details, ornamentation, or materials been chosen that detract from the neighborhood context?
- E-3:** Do specific elements comply with the guideline? Are materials, colors and finishes selected? Visible equipment? Landscaping and Plantings?

Finding. The detailing and materials of the addition to the Carnegie Library complement the existing. A slightly darker red mission textured brick will complement but not complete with the historic structure. A similar tone window wall and roof brow is proposed to echo the material palate of the existing trim and wood windows but will be out of a different material. No overt expression of technology is proposed. Mechanical equipment will be screened.

Design Guidelines: Alteration – Additions

A. Siting

A-1. In addition to the zoning requirements, the relationship of new additions to the street and to the open space between buildings shall be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and with the historic character of the District.

Finding: The placement of the proposed addition is intended to maintain the historic character of the park and the civic character of the Carnegie Library at the center of the park. The placement of the proposed addition minimizes impact to the primary facade. Because the site is entirely surrounded by public ways, the addition will be prominent from several approaches. However, the most historically important views from John Adams St. and the corner of 7th St. and John Adams St. are preserved by the proposed addition placement.

B. Landscape

B-1. Traditional landscape elements evident in the District (grass, trees, shrubs, picket fences, etc.) should be preserved, and are encouraged in site redevelopment.

Finding: The site design of the addition project respects the existing park design and minimizes disturbance to existing site elements. The existing Spray Park is preserved in the proposed design. Some alterations to the existing playground equipment are proposed to open up the accessible entry route from 6th Street. Retaining the historic residential historic landscape context for Library Park is just as and even more important with the proposed large rear addition.

Prior to the release of building permits, the applicant shall revise the site plan to show the existing configuration of the sidewalks and planter strips. Any trees required as part of the site plan and design review process, shall be planted in the park area and be shall be placed behind the sidewalk to maintain the tree canopy inside the park boundary and not introduce new smaller trees to the planter strips. The sidewalk, however, may be increased to 10 feet near the new library entrance and handicap on-street parking spaces to accommodate increased pedestrian traffic and remove barriers for disabled patrons.

Additionally, Staff would like the applicant to provide additional information on the proposed replacement play equipment and proposed padding to see if an additional condition of approval needs to be added to this application

C. Building Height

C-1. In addition to the zoning requirements, the height of new additions shall not exceed the height of the historic building, or of historic buildings in the surrounding area.

Finding: Multiple design approaches were explored that would have been able to comply with this guideline. However, after an extensive public review process, the consensus was the addition should be two stories in order to minimize impact on the size of the park. The addition has been designed with a light, glassy upper floor to minimize the perceived mass of the building.

D. Building Bulk

- D-1. New additions smaller than the historic building or the historic buildings in the surrounding area are encouraged. Where new additions must be larger, the new addition shall be articulated in such a manner that no single element is visually larger than the historic building or surrounding historic buildings.

Finding: The existing Carnegie Library has approximately 5,000 square feet of usable floor space. The programmatic needs of a library serving Oregon City's current population require an addition of approximately three times that square footage. The addition has been articulated, both horizontally and vertically, to break down the massing into elements that are subordinate to the original Carnegie Library. The articulation and ornamentation of the original Carnegie Library also serve to enhance its prominence relative to the simplicity of the addition.

E. Proportion and Scale

- E-1. The relationship of height to width of new additions and their sub- elements such as windows and doors and of alterations shall be compatible with related elements of the historic building, and with the historic character of the District.
- E-2 The relationship of solids to voids (wall to window) shall be compatible with related elements on the historic building, and with the historic character of the District.

Finding: Proposed windows are consistent with the 'storefront' type windows characteristic of the 7th Street Commercial style. Mullions are primarily vertical in orientation, and the typical width of individual lights is derived from the windows of the original Carnegie Library. As described above, large areas of window are used to reduce the perceived mass of the addition relative to the Carnegie Library.

F. Exterior Features

General

- F-1 To the extent practicable, original historic architectural elements and materials shall be preserved.
- F-2 Architectural elements and materials for new additions shall be compatible with related elements of the historic building and with the historic character of the District.

Finding: The proposed design minimizes impact on the Carnegie Library's exterior to the maximum extent possible. At the East (rear) facade, a number of original windows are altered in order to provide through-passage between the existing library and the addition. Otherwise, windows, ornamentation, cornices, and other character-defining elements are all preserved by the project. Exterior materials palette is simple to unify the composition. Similar to darker colored red brick is proposed for the new addition with similar size and coursing as the existing. Use of precast coping, aluminum glazing system with matching crown and soffit material similar to the existing building in color is also proposed. The parapet will be brick and precast coping or metal matching the window system depending on location. A light color kynar finish to complement the cream colored accents of the Carnegie and to allow the upper level and roof line to recede and not compete with the Carnegie is proposed. Other accents could be a basalt or limestone cornerstone. Signage to be minimal and graphics simple.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

Preservation Brief #14, *New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings*

The proposed addition / renovation to the Oregon City Public Library is driven, above all, by the Secretary of the Interior's *Standard 1*: "A property will be used as it was historically." After many years in which library service was provided in a leased commercial property, in 2010 the library returned to its original home in the historic Carnegie Library. This choice came with severe spatial constraints for the library.

The current population of Oregon City is an order of magnitude larger than what the original Carnegie was designed to serve. Over half of the library collection went into storage. The square footage of the existing library is only a fraction of what is called for by state library standards, and the library is unable to provide many crucial services and programs in its present space. In response to this situation, in 2014 the voters of Oregon City approved a bond measure funding an addition to the Oregon City Library on its current site. The bond measure funds the construction of an addition that essentially triples the usable square footage of the library.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

Finding: The purpose of the proposed addition is to allow the Oregon City Public Library to continue to serve its intended purpose in its historic facility.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Finding: The original property was distinguished as a small civic building located in the center of a park. The proposed addition retains the character of the property by being located at the rear of the historic building, maximizing the remaining park area, and preserving the original exterior to the maximum extent possible. Some alterations to the interior will be necessary as part of adapting the facility to the library's present needs; however, alterations to the historic fabric will be avoided when possible, and will be sensitive to the historic design.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

Finding: Conjectural changes are not proposed as part of this project. The entry stair is currently being analyzed for its accuracy as a reconstruction of the original based on historic photos and drawings. The entry stair will be reconstructed as part of the project in order to improve its accuracy as a historic reconstruction.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

Finding: Based on strong community input, a 1960s-era 'spray park' landscape feature is being retained as part of the overall design, even though the spray park is determined to be non-contributing in the National Register application. Other non-contributing alterations to the original Carnegie library and park, such as the 2002 trash enclosure at the east side of the building, have been determined to lack historic significance in their own right, and will be removed by the addition.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Finding: The distinctive elements of the original Carnegie Library include two-tone masonry ornamentation, the wood cornice, and the original wood windows. The operable windows are particularly distinctive, consisting of an awning sash below a hung sash. The proposed project includes window restoration and masonry restoration as needed, although the masonry generally appears to be in good condition. Treatment of the wood cornice at the detailing of the addition intersection will be particularly important in order to keep the original construction in place.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Finding: In general, there appears to be a relatively low level of deterioration in the existing historic features. If deterioration is encountered during the course of construction, repair will be preferred to replacement whenever possible.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Finding:: Chemical treatments, or other potentially damaging treatments, are not currently proposed in the project scope.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

Finding: Based on the recommendation of the local Historic Review Board, an Inadvertent Discovery Plan (IDP) will be developed as part of the project prior to the start of construction.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Finding: The proposed design for the library addition is fully responsive to this standard. The following design elements are specifically intended to respond to the standard:

a) As noted above, the historic spatial relationships of the Carnegie Library and Park are maintained by the proposed addition's subordinate location at the rear of the original building. The placement of the proposed addition minimizes impact to the primary facade and keeps the focus on the original Carnegie from the primary public approaches. A two-story addition is proposed in order to minimize impact on the site area of the park. The Carnegie's character as a small civic 'jewel' in the park is maintained.

b) The proposed addition will be clearly differentiated from the original by a reduced level of ornamentation, larger areas of glazing, and contemporary detailing and articulation.

c) The proposed addition will achieve compatibility with the original through the use of a masonry base matching the original in height, similar proportioning, and materiality. The proposed second story will 'float' the roof over a glass facade in order to reduce the overall perceived mass of the design.

d) The addition and the original building are proposed to be connected by a light 'hyphen' element, consistent with the examples given in Preservation Brief 14. The 'hyphen' will be primarily glass in order to maximize the visibility of the Carnegie's east wall.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Finding: The proposed addition is intended to be structurally independent from the original Carnegie Library. The detailing of the intersection of the original building and the addition will be developed to be 'reversible' to the maximum extent possible. Where it is necessary to alter portions of the east wall for access between the existing library and the addition, the original materials will be called out to be salvaged and stored to the extent possible for potential future reuse. The opening to the rear is sized appropriately however, staff would like the applicant to provide additional explanation for the need add additional glazing under the historic windows rather than keeping the original configuration. The conservative approach is to limit the removal of the rear wall for the minimum need for ingress and egress. However, the applicant may have a valid design need for this approach.



glazing

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff has identified two items that warrant further discussion at the February 24, 2015 HRB meeting.

Address the McLoughlin Neighborhood Associations concern that identified sidewalk and planter strip improvements alters the historic landscape of the park.

- Generally staff support this approach to maintain the tree canopy in the park and not introduce new smaller trees to the planter strips. Likewise sidewalks should remain at 5 feet and only be allowed to increase to ten feet near the 6th Street entrance near the on street handicap spaces.
- Staff would like the applicant to provide additional information on the proposed replacement play equipment and proposed padding to see if an additional condition of approval needs to be added to this application.

In addition, staff would like the applicant to provide some background on the design decision for adding new glazing under the historic windows on the rear elevation.

Staff recommends the Historic Review Board approve the application with the following findings and conditions.

1. Prior to the release of building permits, the applicant shall revise the site plan to show the existing configuration of the sidewalks and planter strips. Any trees required as part of the site plan and design review process, shall be planted in the park area and be shall be placed behind the sidewalk to maintain the tree canopy inside the park boundary and not introduce new smaller trees to the planter strips. The sidewalk, however, may be increased to 10 feet near the new library entrance and handicap on-street parking spaces to accommodate increased pedestrian traffic and remove barriers for disabled patrons.
2. As this complicated project moves through the development review and construction process, small changes to landscaping, sidewalks and minimal deviations from the proposed exterior architectural plans are expected and will be allowed under staff approval, if staff can find that the resulting design meets or exceeds the intent of this submission. Changes to the plans that are more sustainable must be brought back to the Board for approval.

EXHIBITS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Applicant's Submittal
3. Public Comments
 - a. Denyse McGriff -MNA Comments
4. Design Advice – October, November and December HRB meetings (on file)